| **Student Name:** Keshav Mathur |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  You don’t need to repeat the motion when you start. Instead, give me a high impact opening highlighting what the strongest push from your side will be. Then transition into signposting, and then do set-up.  Set-up   * Good work characterising what these families are likely to be, eldest child is unnecessary. * We should characterise what the interests of this actor are. Who are they, what constraints are they in and so forth? What do these kids want? What are their options in this moment.   Following set-up, establish what arguments you’re going to present in your speech; label them and title them and then formally signal - now moving onto my argument.  Argument 1   * Good on why it has to be the best universities and not any others; explain why these universities are inaccessible due to a lack of scholarships or loans etc. Explain why these loans are bad. Good response to the POI! * Explain why the short term benefit of earning money is crucial - why is this in the interest of the actor; they need immediate financial assistance to be able to survive. Explain how the student cares about their parents, their potential siblings as such. * POI - you can say that education is a choice that exists in the future, we’re not writing it off, but we just think at this moment in time, this is the single best option. * We should characterise what making this choice looks like when living under a life of poverty.   03:55 - good ideas, need to focus on structure.  We want to default to calling actors ‘they’ or just ‘the student’, rather than specifically through ‘him’ - just as a general WSDC decorum thing!  You can argue how there are increasing non university options for students, such as online courses, apprenticeships and so on. What is the value of a college degree in the status quo? Does it really lead to mobility as they claim? You need to push three to four years of this student being unable to earn any money to help their family! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Boris Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Explain why affordability is out of this debate straight away. Well identified, but the response itself is missing. Explain why scholarships or financial assistance is possible.  Set-up   * Good job framing, fair on academic development. What is your comparative? Why are they able to go? * What are the interests of the actor? Explain to me how long term success is what needs to matter for social mobility.   Rebuttal   * Don’t take a POI in the middle of a sentence. POI - the point should be that any further education is better than none. We need to work on our phrasing here! * Good on subsidies and scholarships - explain how beyond just them existing, why there is access to them. * Why is a high paying white collar job significantly better? What outcome does this achieve that both sides are striving towards?   Argument 1 (started at 3:16 - you’re 1st Opp!)   * Thesis? * Explain to me what the value of university is! * Why is a university degree the mechanism of change? Is it that many higher-paying jobs and careers require specialised skills and knowledge that are typically acquired through university education? Is it the social network and capital you build at university?   04:10 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Cyrus Yuan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Unpack the observation - that university remains a choice, but survival is not. Their immediate priority must be financial stability and security. Working after graduation allows the student to contribute to the family income, alleviating financial burdens and potentially supporting younger siblings' education. This direct and immediate impact outweighs the long-term, uncertain benefits of a university degree.  Rebuttal   * Affordability - good work systematising analysis here. * I think we want to be comparative; it isn’t just a random public free university in a vacuum; it’s this in comparison to direct work. Why is direct work so valuable? * Good on loans and likelihood; but also even if they do - why is debt so bad? Explain how debt can be crippling for those who are already living within the poverty line.   Argument 1   * Good on incentives of actor; is this particularly new or different from what the first speaker says? You also only give this argument maybe 40 seconds due to time management. * What is the value of a college degree in the status quo? Is this going to lead to the social mobility Opp hints at but never explains? * You need to push three to four years of this student being unable to earn any money to help their family!   04:18 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Nancy Zhao |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  The gap in the debate is the question of whether or not university is feasible for these poor students. Cyrus tells me how this isn’t a possibility; to the extent this is true none of your outcomes can materialise. Resolve this up top.  We need to signpost and signal the structure of our speech following our opening!  Fair on quality of degree - good on this being better than nothing. Good response here! Explain how long term earning potential is what should be the focus on; that this is what the best path towards social mobility is.  Fair on timing, and hence giving time between being harder - this is mitigatory at best, but is a fair response.  Argument 1   * We need to explain why the sacrifice or trade off is worth it. Emphasise that while working immediately might provide short-term financial relief, a university degree offers a path to long-term financial stability and a higher quality of life for both the individual and their family. Highlight the potential for a university degree to not only benefit the individual but also future generations, creating opportunities for their children and grandchildren. * Why is a university degree the mechanism of change? Is it that many higher-paying jobs and careers require specialised skills and knowledge that are typically acquired through university education? Is it the social network and capital you build at university? Good analysis here! Explain how this is what is truly game changing about university. * POI - clear response. * What is the impact of this argument?   03:46 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ishan Harishankar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Is it about them settling, or is it about the constraints their economic status has put on them? You need to point out how all of Opp’s benefits are contingent on access, and to the extent they never do, none of their benefits stand in the debate. Explain what the true interests of this actor must be.  Signposting needs to be more concise.  Why are we still doing extraneous rebuttals? Put everything into clashes please. We spent most of our speech on rebuttal, rather than speeding through extraneous and going into clashes!  Rebuttal   * Alternatives - same comment as above on settling applies here. I think we want to clearly spell out how the most pressing issue for a poor family is often immediate financial stability. Working after graduation allows the student to contribute to the family income, alleviating financial burdens and potentially supporting younger siblings' education. This direct and immediate impact outweighs the long-term, uncertain benefits of a university degree. * The POI from Shawn highlights how the settling analysis is tense. * We need to explain how loans not being paid back becomes a significant issue, because Opp explains how this is pretty common. What are the actual consequences here?   Clash 1 (03:50)   * We could barely get a sentence out here!   You need to push three to four years of this student being unable to earn any money to help their family!  04:21 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Daryl Ng |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Fair opening. What is the need for ‘so proud to Oppose’? It’s a 4 minute speech and you need to be super concise!  Stop spending so much time on extraneous rebuttal - you have to focus on your clashes!  Rebuttal   * Good - but explain why this is necessary from the actor’s perspective. We need to explain why the sacrifice or trade off is worth it (of not working and earning for 3-4 years!). Emphasise that while working immediately might provide short-term financial relief, a university degree offers a path to long-term financial stability and a higher quality of life for both the individual and their family. Highlight the potential for a university degree to not only benefit the individual but also future generations, creating opportunities for their children and grandchildren. * Explain what it means to break out of the poverty cycle! * Good on inherent limitations of blue collar work. Explain how you might be better off immediately, but the likelihood of actual social mobility is close to zero. * POI: good response on likelihood of chances being taken on us. This is important - most outcomes on Opp depend on being able to access good universities in the first place. * Why is a university degree the mechanism of change? Is it that many higher-paying jobs and careers require specialised skills and knowledge that are typically acquired through university education? Is it the social network and capital you build at university?   Clash 1   * How is this different from responses earlier? Put them here!   Clash 2   * Same comment as above!   Put your responses in clashes!  04:20 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Shawn Nip |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Our opening is not very clear. **We say right too much.**  **What is the structure of this speech?**  We need to explain why the sacrifice or trade off is worth it (of not working and earning for 3-4 years!). Emphasise that while working immediately might provide short-term financial relief, a university degree offers a path to long-term financial stability and a higher quality of life for both the individual and their family. Highlight the potential for a university degree to not only benefit the individual but also future generations, creating opportunities for their children and grandchildren.  Explain what it means to break out of the poverty cycle!  Good on inherent limitations of blue collar work. Explain how you might be better off immediately, but the likelihood of actual social mobility is close to zero.  Why is a university degree the mechanism of change? Is it that many higher-paying jobs and careers require specialised skills and knowledge that are typically acquired through university education? Is it the social network and capital you build at university?  01:59 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Lilianna Poon |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house, as a talented student from a poor family, would choose to prioritise working after graduation instead of going to university. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  On opening, point out how all their outcomes are either contingent on public free university working out, or accessing good universities through loans or scholarships. Explain why none of these stand. We just say this doesn’t stand, without explaining why!  I think we want to clearly spell out how the most pressing issue for a poor family is often immediate financial stability. Working after graduation allows the student to contribute to the family income, alleviating financial burdens and potentially supporting younger siblings' education. This direct and immediate impact outweighs the long-term, uncertain benefits of a university degree.  You need to push three to four years of this student being unable to earn any money to help their family!  There’s lots of new material in 3O we need to engage with! I think we want to be comparative; it isn’t just a random public free university in a vacuum; it’s this in comparison to direct work. Why is direct work so valuable?  02:03 | | | | | | |